

Protocol for the format and presentation of an alternative style of doctoral thesis including published material

Note to Readers: This document sets out the University's guidelines for the format and presentation of a thesis including publications. Where arrangements for the presentation of a thesis, specific to the Faculty, are described in more detail these are shown in shaded boxes. The aim is to maintain the appropriate University standards and expectations whilst allowing for some degree of flexibility between Faculties to account for variations in discipline/fields of research.

The Graduate Board encourages all students to publish their work and disseminate their results, either before or after submission of a thesis.

This protocol allows for an alternative style of doctoral thesis to be submitted which includes published material alongside a written commentary. Under this protocol, published material can be included in the thesis without the need for the work to be rewritten and integrated into individual chapters of the thesis. Candidates are accepted for study under the normal arrangements and the existing supervisory, training, monitoring and transfer processes will all apply. This alternative style of doctoral thesis is subject to the same examination process as a traditional, chapter style thesis and assessed against the same criteria/learning outcomes including the volume and quality of original research.

It is recognised that this alternative style of doctoral thesis is not appropriate in all disciplines and that, in some subject areas, the traditional, chapter style of thesis will remain the expected format for the thesis. For this reason not all Faculties offer this alternative format of submission. In Faculties where an alternative style of doctoral thesis is not offered, any published material may be used to form a chapter of a thesis but must be rewritten and integrated within the thesis as a whole – please see the separate guidelines for the use of solely or jointly authored publications for advice: http://students.leeds.ac.uk/info/103553/research_student_policies_and_procedures

This protocol should be read alongside the following documents

- The requirements for the format and presentation of theses for research degrees¹
- Advice on eThesis preparation², copyright and publication³

¹ http://students.leeds.ac.uk/info/103553/research_student_policies_and_procedures

² http://students.leeds.ac.uk/info/10125/assessment/913/submitting_your_final_ethesis

³ <http://library.leeds.ac.uk/copyright-for-phds>

Application for a doctoral thesis including published material

- 1) An alternative style of thesis can only be submitted where (i) the Faculty in which the candidate is registered offers this format of submission and has an approved protocol in place; and (ii) the supervisory team supports this format of submission and is satisfied it is appropriate and meets the protocol in place for that Faculty.
- 2) Any candidate wishing to submit an alternative style of doctoral thesis which includes published material must discuss this with their Supervisory team at an early point in the candidature so that appropriate support and advice can be given. The final decision on the format of submission and whether an alternative style of thesis will be presented is required at the examination entry stage.
- 3) In the relevant section of the GRAD examination entry workflow the Supervisor(s) must provide support for the submission of a doctoral thesis including published material and indicate that this is appropriate and that the publication status of the papers already meets the minimum requirements set out by the Faculty. The Supervisory team must also ensure that the nominated examiners are happy to examine this style of thesis submission.

PhD by publication might be a suitable alternative for thesis submission where presentation of the research material in journal format is paramount i.e. for professional reasons. It is not envisaged that the majority or all researchers undertake this route. A formal sanction by the Head of Graduate School would be required before the PhD by publication can be undertaken. The latest application for the alternative thesis format is three months before the provisional date of the submission and certainly before the submission of the examination entry form. The Head of Graduate School will judge the application for undertaking PhD by publication by the following criteria:

- (1) The current status of the four publications.*
- (2) The proposed date of submission with reference to the 4th year submission.*
- (3) The status of the overarching commentary to go with the thesis.*

Discussion between the supervisory team and the PG researcher should take place at an early stage to determine the thesis format and, therefore, aligning the thesis format with the agreed submission plan.

- 4) Where work which has formed part of any jointly authored publications is included in this alternative style thesis, the Examiners will need to be able to identify the work directly attributable to the candidate to determine whether there is a substantially original contribution to the subject concerned and whether the candidate's own contribution is at the appropriate level to merit the award of the degree.
- 5) To assist the Examiners with this, an outline of the nature and extent of the candidate's own contribution and the contribution of co-authors and other collaborators to the publications must be provided on the examination entry workflow. Another co-author to the papers must attest to the information provided (normally the Supervisor).
- 6) The above information regarding the publications used and the contributions of the other authors should also be included on page 2 of the thesis (intellectual property and publications page) along with a rationale for submitting the thesis in an alternative format and a brief summary of how the thesis has been constructed.

Published material to be included in the alternative style of doctoral thesis

- 7) Publications may only be included where the student is the sole, lead⁴, first or primary author on a publication and their contribution is significant. The work must be derived from original research undertaken whilst registered for doctoral study at this University.
- 8) Work must have been published in peer-reviewed outputs appropriate for the field of research. The publication status (published/accepted) and acceptable externally refereed outputs are not prescribed at a University level and may vary according to discipline. The use of joint-first authored papers is not prescribed at a University level and may vary according to discipline.

An alternative format PhD thesis will include a minimum of 4 article manuscripts that have been written for submission for publication in peer-reviewed academic journals, recognized to be relevant to the field of the student's research.

- *Two of the included manuscripts should have been accepted for publication but they do not need to have been published at the time of the submission of the thesis;*
- *Two further manuscripts should have been submitted and should have received either an invitation to revise and resubmit or a potential acceptance subject to major revisions;*
- *Additional manuscripts (beyond the required 4) may also be incorporated into the thesis and should be developed and formatted to be close to being ready for submission.*

The manuscripts to be included in an alternative format thesis should report findings based on original theoretical or empirical work, modelling etc. that forms a part of the research conducted during the candidate's post-graduate research studies. This means that for example short published contributions such as opinions, comments, commentaries or conference (extended) abstracts are not eligible, and nor are publications predating the commencement of PGR studies in Leeds or based on work conducted prior to commencement of PGR studies in Leeds.

Manuscripts to be included into an alternative format thesis are normally co-authored with supervisors with the student being a lead author. Candidates are asked to provide a breakdown of the contributions of each of the authors. The candidate should provide a contribution of greater than 50 % for a paper to be considered as a bone fide submission. The contribution should be based on academic input, for instance, contributions to the methodology and critical analysis.

- 9) The number of published outputs/papers required for the alternative style of doctoral thesis may vary according to discipline and is not prescribed at a University level, but should reflect the quantity, quality and originality of research and analysis expected of a candidate submitting a traditional, chapter style of thesis.

The minimum number of publications is 4.

No hybrid (publication plus thesis style chapter manuscripts) will be allowed.

⁴ The term "lead" refers to the contribution of the student to the work, rather than the order in which the names of the authors appear on the publication

Critical discussion to link the published material into a coherent whole

- 10) The incorporation of published outputs/papers into the thesis will inevitably lead to some duplication and it is acknowledged that each publication will have self-contained components that may overlap with that in other sections of the thesis. Nevertheless **the work must constitute a continuous body of work** which is a coherent and continuous thesis, rather than a series of disconnected publications. As such, **there must be:**
- a. **an appropriate introduction:** which describes the context of the research, the rationale of the investigation, the strategy employed during the research and demonstrated in the thesis, locates the research to its context and establishes its novelty and contribution; **and**
 - b. **an extensive critical discussion and conclusion:** to support the published material and link these together into a coherent body of work and indicating directions for future work.

An alternative format thesis should contain an introductory section placing the work in context with reference to the peer reviewed literature. The integrating material should contain information on the overall research design, the underpinning engineering science, methods, analysis and discussion/conclusion as well as a critical appraisal across each of the four papers and the peer reviewed literature. Particular attention should be given to the methodology and experimental design. This additional text plus the manuscripts should be bound into single whole.

The integrating material preceding the included manuscripts should not exceed 35,000 words in length and it should contain its own list of references.

The integrating text needs to be format in the form of thesis (e.g. text, size, line spacing). The candidates papers need to be incorporated in the same format including their own list of references.

If the manuscripts included into an alternative format thesis have already been accepted for publication and have progressed through production in the publication outlet. If the manuscripts included into an alternative format thesis have already been accepted for publication and have progressed through production in the publication outlet, permission should be sought from all rights holders including publishers to include the manuscript in the thesis.

When publications are or are to be complemented with supplementary material in print online publication outlets, the material should be presented as appendices of the thesis.

Results, methodology and other sections of the thesis

- 11) Candidates must bear in mind that journal articles/publications can be very restrictive in terms of length. The alternative style of thesis will be assessed according to the same criteria as a traditional, chapter style thesis including the volume and quality of original research. As such, in addition to the published material the thesis will require the same in-depth discussion, critical analysis, and quantity and quality of work that is required for the award of a doctoral degree under the conventional submission route. It is expected that, where appropriate (and with advice from the team of supervisors), the thesis will include a more in depth discussion of the

methodology, results etc than appeared in the original publication. This may vary according to discipline.

Where the manuscripts are or are to be complemented with supplementary material in print or online publication outlets, the material should be presented as appendices of the thesis.

Appendices can also contain other material providing supplementary information related to any preceding part of the thesis.

- 12) Any thesis submitted for examination, including those which use published material must include the following (as outlined in the format and presentation guidelines⁵): a title page, intellectual property and publications page⁶, acknowledgements page, abstract, contents, list of abbreviations, references/bibliography and any appendices.

Page limits and page numbering

- 13) A thesis submitted under the alternative style of doctoral thesis route is not expected to exceed the normal page/word limits for the degree concerned.
- 14) It is accepted that the thesis may include copies of published outputs/papers (e.g. off prints of journal articles, book chapters etc), which already have page numbers. Wherever possible there should be sequential numbering of the thesis as a whole. The publications will therefore bear two numbers; the original from the publication and that which indicates their place in the thesis (but ideally in a different location to the page number from the publication). If this approach is not possible, candidates must ensure that the thesis is clear and easy to navigate by the examiners and any sections of the thesis which are published have been clearly identified.

Assessment of the work

- 15) As with the conventional doctoral thesis, examiners should satisfy themselves that the learning outcomes have been met and the thesis as submitted meets the requirements of the doctoral degree as prescribed in the Ordinance and Regulations for Research Degrees:
http://students.leeds.ac.uk/info/103553/research_student_policies_and_procedures
- 16) The thesis should make an original contribution to the field of research regardless of the format of submission. The alternative style of thesis will be assessed according to the same criteria as a conventional doctoral thesis including the volume and quality of original research and, as such, in addition to the published papers the thesis will require the same in-depth discussion of methodology and results, the same detailed critical analysis, and the same quantity and quality of work required for the award of a doctoral degree under the conventional chapter-style submission route.

5 Included in the Guide to the thesis examination process:

http://students.leeds.ac.uk/info/103553/research_student_policies_and_procedures

6 Which must include information covering the publications used and the contributions of the other authors along with a rationale for submitting the thesis in this format and a brief summary of how the thesis has been constructed.

- 17) It is recognised that journal articles/publications can be restrictive in terms of length and the examiners may feel that a more in-depth justification or discussion of e.g. methodology, results, detailed critical analysis is required in the thesis. As such, it is open to the examiners to require revision or expansion to the publication parts of the thesis as part of any editorial and presentational corrections or minor deficiencies. For example, an addendum to a published paper could be added into the thesis itself, if this was deemed necessary by the examiners as part of any corrections. The School/Supervisor would then need to judge whether any issues identified by the examiners warranted contact with the publishers and/or an addendum to a paper in press.
- 18) **Candidates should be clear that, the fact that a thesis contains material that has been published or accepted for publication does not guarantee that the examiners will recommend the award of the degree for which the candidate is being examined.**

Submission of the final thesis (after the viva)

- 19) Candidates are reminded that the final thesis (after successful examination) must be provided to the University in both hard bound and eThesis format.
- 20) Particular attention should be given to the advice on eThesis preparation, copyright and publication regarding the re-use of published material within an eThesis. Candidates will need to ensure that any publication agreements with the journals concerned include permission to reuse the articles in the thesis (see also note (c) below)⁷.
- 21) After successful examination candidates must submit to the University for the award of the degree:
- a) 1 hard bound copy of the thesis (full text including all publications).
 - b) 1 complete version of the thesis in pdf eThesis format (full text including all publications)
 - c) 1 edited version of the eThesis with any publications redacted where it has not been possible to obtain permission for re-publication of the work in the eThesis from the journal/publisher. In these cases the eThesis must include some form of place holder to indicate the publication has been removed with a link/reference (preferably DOIs for journal articles and ISBNs for books) to the original publication source.

Approved by the Examinations Group July 2016
Version 2 Updated March 2019

⁷ See the advice on eThesis preparation, copyright and publication:
<http://library.leeds.ac.uk/copyright-for-phds> and
http://students.leeds.ac.uk/info/10125/assessment/913/submitting_your_final_ethesis